Title:
Delete “Surprisingly”
insert “Wine” after “Msalais”

Abstract
Line 15: Delete “widely” and “the”, “matrices” not “matrix”
Try not to use the “we”
Line 21” What does “much higher” mean? Delete “much”
Line 22: What do you mean by “any other alcoholic beverage”? Did you analyse every alcoholic beverage available on the market?
Lines 21-22: You say furaneol was formed throughout the wine-making process, yet you say it was mainly formed during fermentation. This sentence does not make sense.
Line 27: Delete “here”

Introduction
Line 35: Delete “widely” and “the”, “matrices” not “matrix”
Line 36: ....has since been....
Line 39:...it has also been...
Line 76: characteristics (delete “character)
Line 78: Delete “etc”
Try not to use the word “we”

Results
2.2
Fermentation: It would help if you can include the details of the starter cultures, i.e. name of the yeasts. Type of fermentation vessels and duration of fermentation
Mention is made that 13 wines were supplied by producers, yet you mentioned in 4.3 that wines were made-confusing. Please clarify.
Line 105: Delete the words “We”, “an obvious” Rewrite. E.g. An increase.....was observed...
Line 111: Delete “obvious”
Line 135:....starter cultures...
Lines 107-139: It is unnecessary to include concentrations in the text if it can be read from the tables and figures.
2.3

Line 152: What does “a lot more furaneol” mean?

Line 156: Delete “we” and “amount”, replace amount with concentration. Rewrite sentence.

Line 157: You can’t analyse an amount. You can quantify furaneol in a matrix.

Lines 159, 160, 162, 163, 164, and 165. Replace the word “amount” with “concentration”

**Discussion**

Try not to use the words “we”, “obvious”, “much”, “amount(s)”, “surprisingly”

Line 180: Reference need at the end of this sentence where you refer to other alcoholic beverages.

Line 184: Explain what “OAV” first and then use the. Unless you have explained it at the beginning of the manuscript.

Line 192: Delete the word “map” Rewrite sentence: The possible biosynthesis pathway of furaneol formation during Msalais wine production (or winemaking) is presented in Figure 3.

Line 194: Delete the word “map”

**Figure 3 heading**

Change to: Figure 3. Multiple biosynthesis pathways of furaneol during Msalais wine making.

As the pathways are not entirely the authors own discovery, other authors need to be acknowledged.

Please correct the following in figure 3:

Amadori rearrangement (it is spelt Amadrio rearrangement-incorrect)

Enzymatic transformation (transformation-incorrect)

Microbiosis (it is spelt in figure 3 as microbioes-incorrect)

Lines 205-256: No need to include concentrations (values) in the text if it is already in a table or figure.

Lines 220 and 223: What does “much higher” mean?

Do not use the “we”

Make sure there is a clear understanding between “glycoside” and “glucoside”

Line 274: Delete “etc”

Lines 290-299: No need to include concentrations (values) in the text if it is already in a table or figure.

Lines 309-317:
Delete “amount”, replace with “concentration”

...furaneol glycosides...

**Materials and methods**

I am concerned about the lack of information regarding microbiology, i.e. name of organisms (yeast/bacteria), fermentation procedures, fermentation vessels used (closed or open), fermentation conditions, cell count, etc.

I am also concerned about the lack of clarity among grape/juice/wine samples. There is some confusing between wines that were purchased (Section 4.2) and experimental juice/concentrate/wines (Section 4.3).

4.2
Wines were bought from different producers??? Were these wines controls?

4.3
I am concerned about the fact that the grape juice underwent natural (spontaneous fermentation) fermentation after it was concentrated for between 90 and 120 min (heat treatment). With the heat treatment, the background yeast population would have been killed.

Not sure I understand section 4.3. In section 4.2 it is mentioned that Msalais wines were supplied from different producers, yet in section 4.3 the preparation and fermentation of the wines are discussed. Are you discussing the winemaking methods the producers used? These two sections are not clear. Microbiology information needs to be added. E.g. yeast type, fermentation kinetics, fermentation conditions, fermentation vessels etc.

Line 342: What do you mean by “cleaning”
How long was the fermentation? Which yeasts were used?

4.4
Line 360: Delete “amount”, replace with “concentration” Please check entire manuscript
Line 364: What type of water was used?
Line 365: Delete “to wash out”, replace with “to elute”
Line 369: rotary vacuum evaporator...

5.
Lines 369-370: Delete “we”, delete “much”. What is meant by “dozen fold”. Rewrite the sentence

References

References need to check for general correctness, punctuation, spelling and spacing.

References 1, 5, 11, 13, 24, 36, 39, 44, 48 and 50 do not have journal names.

Some journal names are abbreviated incorrectly

Line 423: Vitis vinifera should be written in italics

Lines 443-446: This reference is incorrect. What is the name of the journal?

Lines 472 and 478: The yeast name should be in italics

Lines 520 and 533 Vitis labrusca should be in italics