Response to Reviewer 3 Comments

Point 1: Page 2 line 46-49 is not a valid sentence. **Please check all the paper for similar grammatical issues.**

It is better to have two paragraphs in Introduction; it is not comfortable to read a giant paragraph with several meaning in it. At least, the introduction can be separated into two parts around page 2 line 59.

Response 1: We checked the Grammars all over the manuscript and highlighted in red colour. The introduction was separated into two parts and rewrites the phase separation part.

Point 2: Fig 2.1 has two pictures. The first one has a (b)-label. I have no idea what it means. The second one does not have a label. In addition, the explanation in the paper is not clear as well.

Response 2
The first one on the left hand side has been changed from (b) to (a). The second picture is labelled by (b). The picture (a) is a schematic picture of the silica tube used in the experiment which filled with indium metal, gallium metal and ammonia gas which put in a furnace under different temperatures. The second picture (b) is a photograph of the final shape of the prepared material inside the silica tube which indicates to the growth of $\text{In}_x\text{Ga}_{1-x}\text{N}$. This is highlighted in page 3 line 93.

Point 3: In Fig. 2.2 Temperature 750, 950, and 1150 should not be on the same level in the chart.

Response 3
Fig (2.2) changed to three levels as seen in the Figure 2.2 (page 3) line 96.

Point 4: There is no Fig. 2.3 in the paper, which is mentioned in page 3 line 87.

Response 4
You are Right, sorry for that. Fig 2.3 is deleted from the text.

Point 5:
Page 4 line 129 XRD should be spelled out as X-ray diffraction

Response
Ok, we re-write it in page 4 line 114

Point 6:
The Table 3.2 is in page 6 and Table 3.1 in page 7. Moreover, there is Table 3.2 in page 8 again. It is very confusing and hard to follow.
Response 6

It is modified from Table 3.2 to Table 3.2.1 in page 6 line172, Table 3.1 to Table 3.3.1 in page 7 line 205 and the repeated table number 3.2 to 3.3.2 is page 8 line 240.

Point 7

Page 6 is section 3.3 and 3.3.1. However, Page 7 is section 3.2.2. Then on page 8 is section 3.3 and 3.3.1 again! How awkward.

Response 7

You are correct, Section 3.3 and 3.3.1 in page 6 line 137 and section 3.3.2 in page 7 line 207. The repeated sections 3.3 and 3.3.1 were changed to 3.4 and 3.4.1 on page 8 line 242 and line 243 respectively.

Point 8

Page 8 line 262 Table 3.3 may be in page 9 where there is a table with no table title.

Response 8

Ok it is changed from Table 3.3 to Table 3.4.1 line 269 pages 9.

Point 9

Page 8 line 268 the calculation is not based on Table 3.1

Response 9

Ok it is checked and modified to Table [3.4.1] page 9 line 269

Point 10

Page 9 Figure 3.3 caption is overlap with the figure.

Response 10

Ok it is changed from Figure 3.3 to Figure 3.5 in page 9 line 299

…..

One or two typo and grammatical issues is understandable. The paper in current format badly needs a major revision.

Response

The grammars are checked through the manuscript and highlighted in red