

In the paper, namely “Fabrication of MnCoS thin films deposited by SILAR method with assistant of surfactants and the supercapacitor properties”, it is demonstrated the used ionic surfactants, SDS(sodium dodecyl sulfate) and cationic surfactant, CTAB(cetyl trimethyl ammonium bromide) leads to much higher specific capacitance in MnCoS thin films compared to films deposited without the use of surfactants. Films are obtained via SILAR method and have been characterized by electrochemical methods, also cyclic voltammetry was used to determine that MnCoS-CTAB active material exhibits long-term cyclic stability with retention rate of 71 % of specific capacity after 1000 cycles. It is shown that the MnCoS-CTAB material exhibits best value of the specific capacity, followed by MnCoS-SDS, compared to the value of MnCoS-H₂O films and these results are compared to the data find in literature, which is cited.

I believe that only after major revision and changes this paper could be published.

Paper needs the following changes:

1. In the abstract is the first mention of the two surfactants – SDS and CTAB, so their full names should be given in that place in the text.

Responds: the full names of SDS and CTAB have been given in that place in the text.

2. Sentence in rows 73-74 should be corrected.

Responds: Sentence in rows 73-74 have been corrected.

3. In the section 2.2. Deposition of MnCoS thin film – “film” should be in plural form and in the description of the process in row 102 there is abbreviation “ZF” which should be NF.

Responds: “film” and “ZF” have been corrected to “films” and “NF” .

4. Text written below the illustrations in Figure 1 are unclear, figure needs to be Corrected.

Responds: Text written below the illustrations in Figure 1 have been corrected.

5. Figure 3 is missing – from Fig.2 the numbering jumps to Fig.4.

Responds: the numbers of the Figures have been rewritten in order.

6. In Fig.2 scales bars are not visible (d, e and f), these SEM images should be corrected.

Responds: the scales bars in Fig.2(d, e and f) have been corrected.

7. At the end of section 3.2. authors declare that “the MnCoS-CTAB electrode prepared in this work displayed the high specific capacity, higher than that of monometal sulfides thin film synthesized by SILAR, and binary metal sulfides synthesized by hydrothermal method in general, but lower than that binary metal sulfides synthesized by electrodeposited method” asserting that “a denser and stronger thin film was formed via electrodeposited method”. Nowhere in the paper text are mentioned methods for establishing physical characteristics for such properties of the films, tests conducted and results presented. The authors claims are probably based on the SEM images alone, but that's not enough to claim that the films are stronger. Either this part of the text should be redone or the necessary measurements added.

Responds: the last sentence in the section 3.2 is “this may be the reason that a denser and stronger thin film was formed via(“**via**” has benn corrected as “**by**”). electrodeposited method. ” , this is only a speculation, not the author's claim. Because the electrodeposition is driven by external electric field, the charged particles can be deposited quickly and evenly on the electrode surface

and form a dense film, which is a basic common sense, also is the basis of our speculation. In the last sentence, a simple explanation has been added.

8. One of the main flaws of the article is the lack of information about the films thickness. Also method for measuring films thickness, which is not given. Only nanoparticles thickness in given - about ~20 nm.

Responds: we agree with the reviewer. In this paper, the thickness of the film was really not tested, but the mass loading of the active material MnCoS on the NF is provided in the Section”**2.2 Deposition of MnCoS thin films.**” Besides, based on the TEM image, the size of the nanoparticles formed MnCoS thin film is estimated to be 20 nm, not the nanoparticles thickness is 20 nm.

9. Section’s 3.2.2. title is incorrect.

Responds: the section’s 3.2.2.title has been corrected.