

The article with the title “Research on Water Rights Trading and Pricing Model between 2 Agriculture and Energy development” is interesting, and the scope deals with the Sustainability journal. The authors proposed the water rights transfer price model to improve the technical method system of the water rights and water market, especially for its application in Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region. However, there are some general issues that should be addressed:

- a. The title should include a case study location since the proposed model only applied in a specific location in China. Probably, the model is not valid for different locations because of any constraints and specific conditions
- b. The validity of the model. The authors didn't show how to validate or evaluate the model. The acceptable model is the model that is validated with the observed data

In addition, there are some minors issues that should also be addressed:

- a. Abstract. The objective was not stated clearly enough in the abstract
- b. Abstract. The performance of the proposed model should be stated based on the validation/evaluation process.
- c. Introduction. The statement “While Israeli water rights transfer system is similar to that in China (lines 68-69)” should be strengthened with the reference.
- d. Introduction. The reason for choosing the case study at Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region should be explained in more detail. The authors explained the reason in Materials and Methods; however, in my viewpoint, the specific location is better in the Introduction part because it is part of the study's background. Then, the authors can add more explanations of the characteristic of location in the Materials and Method.
- e. Materials and Method. Fig 1 is not clear enough to explain water users in Ningxia. There is no unit the Fig 1 (y-axis)
- f. Materials and Method. The authors should add the unit of some parameters, particularly in Equations 2-8. For example, TVW is the economic value of industrial water intake; what is the unit of TVW? Etc.
- g. Materials and Method. The list of data should be tabulated in the specific table.
- h. Results. It is better to add the table that lists and summarized supply price and demand price as well as the equilibrium price.
- i. Overall. It is better to add more tables or graphics to make the article clearer and more attractive.

Therefore, I think the article can be accepted after revision by addressing the issues.