

Review report on « **Developing multimodal narrative genres in childhood: An analysis of pupils' written texts based on systemic functional linguistics theory.** »

Style and expression

The text is extremely well written. There are minor slips that can be easily corrected during the final proof reading by the author.

(lines 9-10) * The Systemic [SEP]Functional Linguistics offers > Systemic Functional Linguistics[SEP]

(lines 223-24) The analysis of Sara and Marina's products has been [SEP]performed using a table of indicators > was performed [SEP]

Methods and references

Although the empirical study is restricted in scope, the two central microanalyses that were performed are fine grained and relevant to the research question.

Clarity and relevance

In future research, the author(s) should try to distance themselves a little more from the functional-systemic framework of reference, as the reader often gets the impression that the strategy adopted in the paper is mainly applicative.

More work will need to be done in the field of narrativity and visual syntax. In gesture studies (which also handles intersemiosis), a useful distinction is drawn between the "redundant" and "non-redundant" gestures that accompany speech. Although this distinction has been questioned, it raises the important issue of what a particular semiotic system (e.g. visual or visual-kinetic) brings to another one (e.g. verbal) when they are synchronized. The children who write and draw may alternate, as story-tellers do in spoken intercourse), between redundant and non-redundant visuals. Sometimes the picture will "say" something that is not explicitly told ("non-redundant"). At other times, it will echo, repeat, highlight what is there already ("redundant" at the ideational level but meaningful nonetheless at the interpersonal or emotional levels.

The references used are pertinent and congruent with the proposed approach.

The concluding remarks are balanced: they do point to some general tendencies and principles but are careful not to overgeneralize on the sole basis of a micro study.

Overall assessment

This is an excellent paper that should be considered for publication without only minor checks (revisions) before going on line.